

Minutes of the 42nd meeting of SPIA (SPIA 42)



During gaps in the ICAE meetings, Rafain Conference Hotel and Conference Centre, Foz do Iguacu, Brazil (17th – 22nd Aug) and the ISPC meetings, ILRI campus (25th – 28th September)

Participants: Doug Gollin (Chair), Bhavani Shankar, Tim Kelley, James Stevenson, (plus Karen Macours and Madhu Khanna for part of the time)

1 Welcome

The SPIA chair welcomed participants, noting that the format for this meeting was similar to SPIA 41 in that it was somewhat ad hoc in structure and timing in comparison to earlier SPIA meetings.

2 Approval of meeting agenda

The agenda was approved without modification.

3 Follow-up from minutes of SPIA 41

These were approved without amendments.

4 General Discussion

4.1 *Impact assessment focal point meeting (17th August)*

A group of 20 participants comprising scientists from 10 CGIAR centers, SPIA members and secretariat, and two donors spent several productive hours discussing the Strengthening Impact Assessment in the CGIAR proposal. Doug Gollin gave a presentation to the group regarding the objectives and possible strategies / activities for large program of work over three years. Detailed comments were received from the CGIAR scientists, most of which were positive and all of which were constructive and designed to ensure the final program is as useful to the CGIAR as it can be. SPIA considered that the meeting had raised awareness of the initiative among the focal points and several specific recommendations were made to help to shape its development.

b. *Pre-conference workshop (18th August) “Innovations in impact assessment of agricultural research: Theory and practice”*

Up to 70 participants crammed into the pre-conference workshop that SPIA organised on 18th August (agenda for the workshop attached as an annex). There was a full day of invited papers (from Tavneet Suri, Joaquim Bento de Souza Ferreira Fliho and Keith Fuglie), 14 contributed papers / posters, and a very enlightening panel discussion with a set of CGIAR donor representatives. While the quality of the papers was somewhat variable, the day as a whole was a great success that raised the visibility of what SPIA does with its core constituents as well as reaching out to a number of newcomers through people simply turning up to the session unannounced. A special issue of Food Policy will be put together, with Bhavani Shankar, Tim Kelley, Mywish Maredia and James Stevenson as guest editors.

c. *SPIA strategy / ways of working*

Doug Gollin explained how he would like to change the nature of SPIA membership to make it less time-consuming for busy academics. The proposal is to recruit SPIA associates to a pool of affiliated talent who will offer their expertise on a limited range of issues that SPIA needs help with, rather than the more generalist model that played out in the past. This will reduce the time requirement for a SPIA associate to 10 – 15 days per year. One specific role for a SPIA associate could be to lead a call for proposals process under Objective 3 of the SIAC project, shepherding a batch of studies from inception to completion and updating the wider SPIA group periodically on progress of that cohort. While something is lost from the old model, in terms of having a critical mass of people that have an eye on

everything that SPIA is responsible for, Doug feels that this responsibility can rest with the Chair and the Secretariat, freeing up the associates to have a more tightly focused role.

Action: Proceed with SPIA associate model of 10 -15 days / year, drawing on a larger pool of academics for specific tasks in the SIAC grant.

5 On-going studies

5.1 *Diffusion and impact of improved varieties in Africa (DIIVA)*

Given the parallel process for managing the DIIVA grant through the Project Steering Committee, no time was spent discussing progress at this meeting. The final workshop at Bioversity is going ahead, with logistical arrangements in hand between FAO and Patti Sands (contact at Bioversity).

5.2 *Impact on poverty and under-nutrition*

A mid-term workshop took place at London International Development Center, 8th and 9th May 2012. The case-study leaders presented progress to date and received feedback on their plans for finalizing the study from SPIA members and a number of invited external participants. Each of the case study leaders submitted brief progress reports following the mid-term workshop indicating what changes they would make in response to the critique they received. Of the four case-studies commissioned, it was felt that those led by CIMMYT, WorldFish and IRRI did not require further follow-up until close to final report stage in early-2013. However, the study led by IFPRI across all CGIAR centers in Ethiopia required remedial action as progress had been too slow.

Action: Doug Gollin to contact Shenggen Fan, Peter Hazell and to suggest to Xinshen Diao that she travel to Ethiopia urgently to see what can expedited in the process.

It was agreed that we would request a draft of the final report by 1st March 2013.

Action: Tim Kelley / James Stevenson to contact focal points for the study to advise them of the revised timetable.

Bhavani Shankar has been working on a paper on the nutrition impacts of agricultural research, and will aim for a draft ready for peer-review by March 2013. It will be a short paper, and there is the potential to sub-contract some of it given the demands on Bhavani's time.

Action: Bhavani Shankar to develop the paper further in time for feedback at SPIA 43 in March 2013.

On the review paper of poverty impacts originally developed by Tim Kelley for the IFPRI workshop in December 2010 prior to the launch of this set of case-studies, it was agreed that this was something that could benefit from being sub-contracted to a young researcher with time to complement what Tim has already put together (e.g. Sarah Mine, who did such a good job in Tanzania in testing the pigeonpea varietal identification protocol).

Action: Tim to contract a junior researcher to work with him on finishing the paper as input (along with the SPIA foreword) to the final report.

SPIA had received an informal proposal from Nelson Villoria at Purdue University for estimating the macro-level effects of research-derived productivity changes on poverty by linking a Computable General Equilibrium model (GTAP) with household survey data in a number of countries. However, it was felt that the timing on this was not right as we first needed the final, consolidated dataset from the DIIVA project in order to provide him with new productivity shocks.

Action: Wait for new numbers and consider contacting Nelson Villoria to solicit a proposal under the SIAC project Objective 3.

5.3 *Legume impact study*

There was no discussion of this study, with several components pending. A discussion on what we need for the final report will take place at SPIA 43 meetings in March / April. Tim Dalton has agreed in principle to write the final report.

5.4 *Germplasm Collection Conservation Characterisation and Evaluation*

Doug Gollin and Tim Kelley are consulting with the authors of these studies and will finalise the drafts by end of November 2013. They will then be posted on the <http://impact.cgiar.org> website.

5.5 *RCTs*

Doug Gollin made the decision not to pursue publication of the SPIA note on randomised control trials that we have been discussing for some time. We do not want to put off potential collaborators who use this methodology.

6. **Publications / communications**

6.1 *Special issue of Food Policy*

Authors that presented their work in the pre-conference workshop on 18th August now have until 15th October to revise their drafts following input from discussants. Once these revised versions have been received, they will be sent out for double-blind peer-review by a single external reviewer. Once external reviews have been received, those papers that are still in contention for publication will have until March 2013 for submitting their final versions.

6.2 *Land paper follow-up*

A short version of the SPIA land-use paper is currently under review with *PNAS* for consideration as part of a special issue on agricultural innovations to protect the environment. Two further publications related to this work are in the pipeline. First, Derek Byerlee, Nelson Villoria, Alla Golub and James Stevenson are working on the ex-ante simulations of technological change in oil palm in Indonesia and Malaysia on greenhouse gas emissions. This is to be presented in San Diego in January 2013 at the American Social Sciences Association annual meetings and published in the proceedings in the *American Journal of Agricultural Economics*. Second, Nelson Byerlee, Derek Byerlee and James Stevenson have been invited to write a long-form review paper on Agricultural Technology, Land-Use and Deforestation for the journal *Applied Economics Policy Perspectives*.

A further paper emerging from the Environmental Impact Assessment study has just been published in *Research Evaluation*: Bennett, Kelley and Maredia (2012) "Integration of environmental impacts into ex-post assessments of international agricultural research: Conceptual issues, applications and the way forward".

6.3 *Other communications*

A draft of the SPIA newsletter was prepared, but this has stalled and should be re-written to announce the SIAC project. The website numbers for the three months June 1 2012 – Sept 1 2012 were 3381 total visits, steady at around 1,100 visits per month.

7 **2013 – 2015 SIAC program**

Karen Macours and Madhu Khanna were briefed on the SIAC initiative.

8 **SPIA strategy**

Covered in agenda item 4.

9 **Any other business**

None

Annex - Program for SPIA pre-conference workshop at ICAE, Foz do Iguacu, Brazil: Saturday 18th August 2012
"Innovations in impact assessment of agricultural research: Theory and practice"

Time	Topic	Speaker
08:30	SPIA welcome and introductions	Doug Gollin
KEYNOTE SPEAKERS (Chair: Doug Gollin)		
08:45	Computable general equilibrium models as a tool for ex-ante assessment of poverty impacts from agricultural research	Joaquim Bento de Souza Ferreira Filho (Sao Paolo)
09:30	Technology adoption in agriculture: Access, markets and learning externalities	Tavneet Suri (MIT)
10:15 – 10:30 Coffee		
POLICY-ORIENTED RESEARCH / INSTITUTIONAL INNOVATIONS (Chair: Bhavani Shankar)		
10:30	A review from a Bayesian perspective of problems in ex post impact assessment of policy oriented research	Bob Lindner
11:00	Does marginal cost pricing of electricity affect groundwater pumping behavior of farmers? Evidence from West Bengal, India	Aditi Mukherji (IWMI)
11:30	Decentralized Innovation Systems and Poverty Reduction: Quasi-Experimental Evidence from Central Africa	Erwin Bulte (Wageningen Univ.)
12:00	Evaluating the impact of high value markets on smallholder efficiency in the Ecuadorean Sierra: A stochastic production frontier approach correcting for selectivity bias	Mario Gonzalez (American Univ.) and Boris Bravo-Ureta (Univ. Connecticut)
12:30 – 14:00 STAND-UP LUNCH WITH POSTERS		
	Ex-ante impact assessment of "stay-green" drought tolerant sorghum cultivar under future climate scenarios	S. Nedumaran (ICRISAT)
	Measuring the impacts of site-specific nutrient management (SSNM) on rice production: Evidence from farm-level survey in Red River Delta, Northern Vietnam	Divina Gracia P. Rodriguez (Univ. Illinois)
	Does cassava processing research-for-development have an impact on fabricator, processor and farm level outcomes? Evidence from Nigeria	Joseph Rusike (IITA)
	Do Lower Yielding Farmers Benefit from Bt Corn? Evidence from Instrumental Variable Quantile Regressions	Santi Sanglestawai (NCSU)
	Adoption of improved wheat varieties and impacts on household food security in Ethiopia: Application of generalized propensity score and error correction econometric techniques	Bekele Shiferaw (CIMMYT)
	Impact assessment and agricultural research: The case for cost-benefit analysis	Stephen Andoseh (USAID)
AFRICAN SUCCESS STORIES? (Chair: Derek Byerlee)		
14:00	The impact of adoption of NERICA rice varieties in West Africa	Aliou Diagne (Africa Rice)
14:30	An assessment of the ex-post socio-economic impacts of global rinderpest eradication: methodological issues and applications to rinderpest control programs in Chad and India	Karl Rich (NUIPI - Norway)
15:00	The Impact of Maize Hybrids on Income, Poverty, and Inequality among Farm Households in Kenya	Mary Mathenge (Tegemeo Inst.)
15:30	The impact of agricultural technology adoption: What are we measuring exactly?	Aliou Diagne (for Ben Groom, SOAS)
16:00 – 16:15 Coffee		
INVITED SPEAKER (Chair: Mywish Maredia)		
16:15	Ex ante impact assessment for research prioritization	Keith Fuglie (USDA)
DONOR PERSPECTIVES ON IMPACT ASSESSMENT (Chair: Prabhu Pingali)		
17:00	Impact assessment policies and practices of EIARD member, followed by donor panel on perspectives regarding demand for, and use of, impact assessment results	Adrienne Martin (NRI) Panel of: Ajay Sharma (DFID), Stephen Andoseh (USAID), Greg Traxler (BMGF)
18:00	Close	